

Australian Government

Defence Honours and Awards Appeals Tribunal

ERNEST FLINT (ON BEHALF OF ANNE SHEAN ON BEHALF OF CHARLES WHELAN) AND DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE [2013] DHAAT (18 February 2014)

File Number (s)	2013/003
Re:	Ernest Flint (on behalf of Mrs Anne Shean on behalf of her late father Charles Leonard Whelan) APPLICANT
And	Department of Defence RESPONDENT
Tribunal	Professor D. Horner AM (Chair) Mr A. Bodzioch
Hearing Date	No hearing was conducted for this review.

DECISIONS

On 18 February 2014 the Tribunal decided that:

a. the decision of the Directorate of Honours and Awards of the Department of Defence that Mr Charles Leonard Whelan not be awarded the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star be substituted by the new decision that Mr Whelan be awarded the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star; and

b. the review of Mr Whelan's eligibility for the Australia Service Medal (ASM) 1939-45 be held over until the Tribunal has concluded its 'Inquiry Into Unresolved Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ships Section'.

CATCHWORDS

Defence Award; the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and the Australia Service Medal 1939-45.

LEGISLATION

Defence Act 1903 as amended Defence Force Regulations 1952, Reg 93C Air Ministry Order A755/1943 Commonwealth Navy Order 400/45 United Kingdom Command Paper 6833 of June 1946 Dedman Paper 1948 – Criteria for 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star, and the War Medal 1939-45 (Merchant Navy) Royal Warrant for the Australia Service Medal 1939-45

REASONS FOR DECISION

Introduction

1. The applicant Mr Ernest Flint (on behalf of Mrs Anne Shean on behalf of her late father Charles Leonard Whelan), seeks review of the decision of the Directorate of Honours and Awards of the Department of Defence (the Directorate) that Mr Whelan is not eligible for the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and the Australia Service Medal (ASM) 1939-45. Mr Whelan, an Australian, served with the United States (US) Army Small Ships Section in the New Guinea-Australia area in the period 1942 to 1945.

The Tribunal's Jurisdiction

2. There is no dispute that the Tribunal has jurisdiction to hear and determine Mr Flint's application to review the decision of the Directorate in regard to Mr Whelan's application for the award of the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and the ASM 1939-45 (see ss 110V, 110VA and 110VB(2) of the *Defence Act 1903* and reg 93C of *Defence Force Regulations 1952*).

3. The role of the Tribunal, in reviewing the Directorate's decision, is to determine whether the decision of the Directorate is the correct and preferred decision having regard to the applicable law and the relevant facts.

4. The Tribunal will conduct a merits review of the Directorate's decision, which means that it considers an application on Mr Whelan's behalf afresh and makes a preferable decision as to his eligibility for the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and the ASM 1939-45.

Background

5. In October 2011 Mrs Shean provided documentation to the Directorate that showed that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* from 3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943. As a result, on 17 November 2011, the Directorate advised Mrs Shean that Mr Whelan was eligible for the War Medal 1939-45 for this period.

6. Mrs Shean and Mr Flint also provided the Directorate with documents from the United States to show that Mr Whelan commanded S-174 *Maiala* from 8 June 1944 until 30 September 1945, and that this appeared to be confirmed by an account in the book *Forgotten Fleet* 2 by Bill and Ruth Lunney.¹ The Directorate did not accept this documentation as proof that Mr Whelan commanded S-174 *Maiala* for the

¹ Bill and Ruth Lunney, Forgotten Fleet 2, An Updated and Expanded History of the Part Played by Australian Men and Ships in the US Army Small Ships Section in New Guinea: 1942 -1945, Forfleet Publishing, Meadowie, NSW, 2004.

appropriate period and hence determined that he was not eligible for the 1939-45 Star or the Pacific Star.

7. In addition, Defence further determined that the regulations governing the award of the ASM 1939-45 did not allow it to be awarded to members of the US Army Small Ships Section, and hence Mr Whelan could not be awarded that medal.

8. On behalf of Mrs Shean, Mr Flint applied to the Tribunal for a review of these decisions on 6 January 2013. In accordance with its Procedural Rules 2011, on 31 January 2013, the Tribunal wrote to the Secretary of the Department of Defence informing him of Mr Flint's application for review and requesting that he provide a report. On 14 March 2013, the Directorate, on behalf of the Secretary, provided the Tribunal with a report. A copy of the report of the Directorate was forwarded to Mr Flint for comment. On 25 May 2013, a written response was received from Mr Flint.

9. On 20 June 2013 the Secretariat provided further documentation (provided by Mr Flint) to the Directorate with a request for a reassessment of Mr Whelan's eligibility for the awards sought. On 15 July 2013, the Directorate provided a further submission confirming that Mr Whelan was not eligible for the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star or the ASM 1939-45.

Eligibility Criteria for the award of the 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and the ASM 1939-45

10. The 1939-45 Star, the Pacific Star and a number of other Stars² are campaign medals of the British Commonwealth, established to recognise service in certain operations during the Second World War.

11. The conditions for the award of the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star are set out in a number of documents.³ For the purposes of determining eligibility in the Australian armed forces after the Second World War the conditions were set down in December 1948, when The Hon. John J. Dedman, the Australian Minister of State for Defence, issued a Summary of the Conditions of the Award of the Campaign Stars, The Defence Medal and the War Medal.⁴ Known generally as the Dedman

² These include; the Africa Star, the Atlantic Star, the Air Crew Europe Star, the Italy Star, the France and Germany Star the Pacific Star and the Burma Star.

³ Air Ministry Order A.M.O. A.755/1943, 3 August 1943, *Introduction of Africa and 1939-43 Stars, etc;*. Committee on the Grant of Honours Decorations and Medals in Time of War – Campaign Stars and the Defence Medal, HMSO, London, May 1945. Available at <u>www.northeastmedals.co.uk/britishguide/hmso/campaign_stars_defence.htm</u>; and United Kingdom Command Paper No 6833, June 1946.

⁴ A copy of the '*Dedman Paper*' can be found on the following web site: http://www.defence.gov.au/medals/Content/+040%20Campaign%20Medals/+100%20Wor ld%20War%20II/WW2%20Dedman%20Paper%20transcript.pdf

Paper, it is also a summary of the provisions of the Air Ministry Order No A.755/1943 and the 1945 and 1946 United Kingdom Command Papers.

12. The Dedman Paper states that the 1939-45 Star is granted for service in operations during the period from 3 September 1939 to 2 September 1945. The qualifying conditions include:

Navy

- (a) The qualification is six months service afloat in areas of active operations during the period from 3 September 1939 to 2 September 1945 inclusive:
 - (i) From 3 September 1939 to 31 May 1940 the general Atlantic Ocean and part of the Indian Ocean.
 - (ii) From 1 June 1940 to 9 June 1940, as (i) with the addition of the Pacific Ocean and the rest of the Indian Ocean.
 - (iii) From 10 June 1940 to 9 May 1945, anywhere at sea
 - (iv) From 9 May 1945 to 2 September 1945 the area of the Pacific Ocean (which included the areas off the coast of Australia)

Merchant Navy. Members of the Merchant Navy receive the 1939-45 Star under the same conditions as the Royal Navy, except that six months service is the qualifying period provided that at least one voyage was made through one of the specified areas of active operations.

13. The Dedman Paper states that the Pacific Star is awarded for entry into operational service in the Pacific Theatre between 8 December 1941 and 2 September 1945 inclusive. In the Navy and the Merchant Navy, the 1939-45 Star must be earned by six months service in operations before a person can qualify for the Pacific Star. For the Navy and Merchant Navy, service in the Pacific Ocean was defined as including the South China Sea, and the Indian Ocean east of a line running due south from Singapore round the south-east coast of Sumatra, through Christmas Island.

14. For service at sea there was a special rule relating to operational service in the last six months up to 2 September 1945. Personnel who had served in the operational area during this time qualified for the Pacific Star and the prior time qualifications of six months did not apply. If the total operational service was less than six months they were not awarded the 1939-45 Star.⁵

15. In summary, to be eligible for the 1939-45 Star Mr Whelan needed to have served for six months afloat during the period 3 September 1939 to 2 September 1945

⁵ United Kingdom Command Paper No 6833, June 1946, and Dedman Paper – Criteria for 1939-45 Star, Pacific Star and War Medal 1939-45 December 1948.

in the designated area (the sea around Australia is included) with at least one voyage through a specified area of operations (for example, New Guinea). To receive the Pacific Star an applicant from the Navy or the Merchant Navy must have earned the 1939-45 Star and have served (made at least one voyage) in the Pacific Ocean, South China Sea or part of the Indian Ocean.

16. In September 2008, the Defence Honours and Awards Tribunal (the old Tribunal)⁶ was directed by Government to conduct an 'Inquiry into Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ship Section', which in essence, was to review the service of those who served on the US Army Small Ships for recognition for awards relevant to Australian Service personnel who served during the Second World War.

17. As mentioned in the old Tribunal's Report, the service of Australian seamen who served in the US Army Small Ships was recognised by the US Government. Upon application, some of these Australians have received Second World War US service medals and awards. These awards are recognised by the Australian Government, as in the right to wear them. However, these seamen were unsuccessful for many years in receiving recognition for their contributions in the form of Australian or Imperial Second World War campaign medals and stars.

18. On 26 August 2009 the Government accepted the old Tribunal's recommendation that Australian civilian personnel who served in ships operated by the US Army Small Ships Section between 1942 and 1945 should be recognised as eligible for Australian or Imperial recognition for that service on the same basis as members of the Merchant Navy.

19. The Australia Service Medal 1939-45 was established to recognise the services rendered during the War of 1939 to 1945 by all members of the Australian Armed Forces and Australian Mercantile Marine, or as civil members of the Royal Australian Air Force Reserve who served as aircrew in civil aircraft in operational areas. According to the Royal Warrant, (Commonwealth *Gazette* 30 November 1949), the qualifying service for full-time duty was eighteen months at home or overseas.

⁶ In 2008, when the Parliamentary Secretary gave the direction to inquire into and report on *Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ship Section* the Defence Honours and Awards Tribunal (the old Tribunal) operated administratively. On 5 January 2011, on the commencement of the provisions in Schedule 1 of the *Defence Legislation Amendment Act 2010* (the Defence Amendment Act), the old Tribunal became the Defence Honours and Awards Appeals Tribunal (the new Tribunal, or the Tribunal). Part 1 of Schedule 1 of the Defence Act), which contained the provisions for the establishment of the new Tribunal, its members and its powers and functions.

In the case of members of the Australian Mercantile Marine, the eighteen months period should have been served at sea.⁷

Mr Whelan's Service

20. Mr Whelan signed up as a contractor to the US Army Small Ships Section on 3 July 1942. He was discharged as a civilian employee on 15 August 1945 (end of the war). On 16 August 1945 Mr Whelan was then re-engaged through to 30 September 1945.

21. The US Army's Form - DD214 US Certificate of Release or Discharge from Active Duty and Form - DD215 US Correction to DD214⁸ show that Mr Whelan commanded at least two US Army Small Ships during three periods of service in the Second World War.

- (1) From 3 July 1942 to 1 October 1942, on S-52 Margaret Twaits;
- (2) From 3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943 on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* (132 days awarded the War Medal 1939-45 for this period); and
- (3) From 8 June 1944 to 30 September 1945 on S-174 Maiala.

Mr Flint's Arguments

22. Mr Flint, on behalf of Mrs Shean, has argued that all available US documentation provided to the Directorate clearly shows that Mr Whelan was a member of the US Army Small Ships Section, having served on board S-52 *Margaret Twaits* and S-174 *Maiala* from 3 July 1942 until 30 September 1945 sailing in the Australian and South West Pacific waters. His total active service for this period was one year five months and seven days.

23. The evidence presented to the Directorate by Mrs Shean and Mr Flint about Mr Whelan's service, includes:

• A US Army certificate which indicates that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* for 132 days (3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943) including service in the operational area;

⁷ *Commonwealth of Australia Gazette*, No 91, 30 November 1949.

⁸ DD214 Certificate of Release and Discharge from Active Duty dated August 2009. The DD Form 214 is a US Army form and is the authority used by the US Army as a 'Consent of Release or Discharge from Active Duty' for a person serving with the US Army. It provides detailed information as to name, date of birth, contact details and exact dates and places of active service. The DD Form 215 is a 'Correction to DD Form 214, Certificate of Release or Discharge from Active Duty'. In Mr Whelan's case the DD Form 215 was used to insert the relevant ships names into his record.

- A US Army certificate which states that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* from 3 July 1942 to 1 October 1942;
- A US Army certificate which states that Mr Whelan served on 'active duty' on the S-174 *Maiala* from 8 June 1944 to 30 September 1945;
- The book, *Forgotten Fleet 2*, which states that Mr Whelan was the skipper of S-174 *Maiala* in 1943-44, that the ship sailed between Port Moresby and Townsville, and that after the war he sailed her back to Sydney where she was sold. By 1988, with a different name, she sailed in the Tall Ships Regatta for the Australian Bicentenary and was still sailing in 1999;
- An incomplete S-174 *Maiala's* ship's log which shows that she sailed from Sydney to Brisbane and then on to Townsville in March-April 1943. The only other log entry is that she 'arrived' in Townsville on 15 February 1945;
- DD214 US Certificate of Release or Discharge from Active Duty dated November 1988;
- DD214 US Certificate of Release or Discharge from Active Duty dated 18 May 2010; and
- DD215 US Correction to DD214 dated 14 May 2013 accompanied by a letter from US Department of the Army, Army Human Resources Section.

The Directorate's Arguments

Having received the above documents, in its submission dated 14 March 2013, the Directorate confirmed the service of 132 days afloat from 3 June 1943 to
12 October 1943 enabled Mr Whelan to qualify for the War Medal 1939-45.

25. The Directorate has acknowledged that documentation provided confirms that Mr Whelan served with the US Army Small Ships Section from 3 July 1942 to 30 September 1945, which is in excess of three years. They also confirmed that Mr Flint and Mrs Shean provided documentation to prove that Mr Whelan served for 132 days (3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943) aboard the S-52 *Margaret Thwaits* and has now been awarded and issued with the War Medal 1939-45.

26. However, while the Directorate accepted that Mr Whelan was aboard the S-52 *Margaret Twaits* from 3 July 1942 to 1 October 1942 it 'found that there was no evidence that the ship was afloat for the period Mr Whelan served aboard'.

27. On 20 June 2013, the Tribunal's Secretariat provided further documents from Mr Flint to the Directorate relating to Mr Whelan's service aboard S-174 *Maiala*. The Directorate reassessed Mr Whelan's eligibility for the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star, and further denied Mr Whelan the medals on the basis that the movements of S-174 *Maiala* did not show evidence of the location of the ship when Mr Whelan was captain.

28. The Directorate:

- Accepted the US Army certificate which indicated that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* for 132 days (3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943) and hence accepted that he was eligible for the War Medal 1939-45; and
- Accepted that Mr Whelan served aboard S-174 *Maiala* from 8 June 1944 to 30 September 1945, but noted that 'there were no clear movements for the period that Mr Whelan was on board, therefore [it] was unable to aggregate any further days towards the total of 132 from the previous assessments'; but
- Discounted the evidence in the books *Forgotten Fleet* and *Forgotten Fleet* 2.

29. Due to the lack of evidence about the S-174 *Maiala's* movements Defence was unable to conclude that Mr Whelan served for six months afloat and hence decided he was not eligible for the 1939-45 Star or Pacific Star.

30. In addition to the above, Defence further determined that the regulations governing the award of the ASM 1939-45 (Royal Warrant) did not allow it to be awarded to members of the US Army Small Ships Section, and hence Mr Whelan could not be awarded that medal.

Conduct of the Review

31. The Tribunal met on 16 October and 6 December 2013 and on 12 February 2014 to consider this evidence. The Tribunal did not hold a hearing having decided to conduct the review based upon the documentation provided by Mrs Shean, Mr Flint and Defence. It conducted a close examination of the documentation and arguments presented by all parties.

32. The Tribunal noted that Mr Flint had presented on several occasions as much documentation as possible from the United States. Nonetheless, the Tribunal directed its staff to undertake further wide-ranging research to try to discover any more evidence about the role of S-52 *Margaret Twaits* and S-174 *Maiala*. The Tribunal contacted one of the surviving authors of *Forgotten Fleet 2* in an effort to find supporting material that might have been used when writing the book.⁹ No further evidence could be found.

33. From its research, the Tribunal found that Commonwealth Navy Order (CNO) 400/45 of 11 September 1945 defined the meaning of the expression 'service afloat' for the purposes of qualification for campaign medals and stars. According to this Order, 'service afloat' meant service while borne for pay on the books of a ship of war in sea going commission. Service while refitting might count as 'service afloat' provided that the ship remained in commission. Service afloat did not apply when serving on stationary depot ships which went to sea when proceeding from

9

Bill and Ruth Lunney, Forgotten Fleet 2,

port to port, at shore bases, or in vessels employed wholly or mainly within boom protected ports, or when no boom exists, within the limits of smooth water.

Tribunal's Consideration

34. The Tribunal noted that the Directorate had accepted the evidence of the US Army certificate which indicated that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* for 132 days (3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943). This certificate also stated that Mr Whelan had served in the operational area and Mr Whelan had met one of the requirements for the 1939-45 Star, namely that he had served in an operational area.

35. The next requirement for the 1939-45 Star was that the recipient needed to have served for six months in the designated area, which included the sea around Australia. The Tribunal agreed with the Directorate's contention that there is no documentary evidence that S-52 *Margaret Twaits* was afloat between 3 July 1942 and 1 October 1942, or that S-174 *Maiala* was afloat between 8 June 1944 to 30 September 1945 such that would allow Defence to conclude that Mr Whelan 'served afloat' for the additional 50 days necessary for him to be eligible for the 1939-45 Star.

36. The Tribunal considered the meaning of the expression 'service afloat' as described in CNO 400/45 (see paragraph 33). The Tribunal concluded that the US Army certificates show that Mr Whelan served on ships that were commissioned as part of the US Army Small Ships Section, namely S-52 *Margaret Twaits* and S-174 *Maiala*. There was no requirement to show that the ships were actually at sea for all the time needed for Mr Whelan to qualify for the 1939-45 Star, because according to CNO 400/45 'service afloat' could include time when the ship was refitting, provided that the ship remained in commission.

37. Further, considering the literal interpretation of the term 'afloat' meaning that the ship was actually at sea, the Tribunal considered on the balance of probabilities that it was highly likely that Mr Whelan served the necessary extra 50 days 'afloat' on S-174 *Maiala* for the following reasons:

- It is not necessary to show that S-174 *Maiala* sailed to New Guinea again, merely that she sailed in Australian waters.
- It is highly unlikely that the US Army would have certified Mr Whelan as being 'on active duty' if the ship was not afloat between 8 June 1944 and 30 September 1945;
- While the sources for *Forgotten Fleet* are not listed and cannot be located, it is an otherwise thorough book with a mass of detail;¹⁰

¹⁰ The book is used as a major source in a recent article in the US Army's professional history magazine. See Kenneth J. Babcock, 'MacArthur's small ships: Improvising water transport in the Southwest Pacific Area', *Army History*, Winter 2014.

- The S-174 *Maiala* log is incomplete with a gap between 16 April 1943 and 15 February 1945. Given that the US Army certifies Mr Whelan as being 'on active duty' on S-174 *Maiala* from 8 June 1944, it is extremely unlikely that the ship remained in dock from 8 June 1944 to 15 February 1945 when it is shown as 'arriving' in Townsville. We think it a reasonable assumption that the ship 'sailed' into Townsville and did not arrive on the flatbed of a train;
- S-174 *Maiala* was seaworthy enough to keep sailing until at least 1999, so it is unlikely to have been laid up between June 1944 and September 1945 when every ship available was being used for the war effort;
- Given that the Directorate has accepted that Mr Whelan served afloat for 132 days (3 June 1943 12 October 1943), for him to receive the 1939-45 Star he needed to have served afloat for just a further 50 days during the period 8 June 1944 to 15 August 1945 (the end of the war) which amounts to 433 days. That is, S-174 *Maiala* needed to be afloat for just 12 per cent of the latter time for him to accrue the required number of days;
- The evidence of the activities of S-52 *Margaret Twaits* from 3 July 1942 to 1 October 1942 is less clear.

38. To receive the Pacific Star Mr Whelan needed to have received the 1939-45 Star and have served in the Pacific Ocean, South China Sea or part of the Indian Ocean. As noted above, the US Army certificate which indicated that Mr Whelan served on S-52 *Margaret Twaits* for 132 days (3 June 1943 to 12 October 1943) also stated that Mr Whelan had served in the operational area, i.e., the Pacific Ocean area. Hence if he was eligible for the 1939-45 Star he was also eligible for the Pacific Star.

39. The regulations governing the award of the ASM 1939-45 set out in the Royal Warrant state that persons eligible were those who served 'in the Australian Armed Forces, in the Australian Mercantile Marine, or as civil members of the Royal Australian Air Force Reserve who served as aircrew in civil aircraft in operational areas' for a period of eighteen months, with various conditions attached.¹¹ The old Tribunal's report of the 'Inquiry into Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ships Section', of 29 August 2009, recommended that members of the US Army Small Ships Section be recognised as eligible for Australian or Imperial awards for their service 'on the same basis as members of the Merchant Navy'. The question then arose as to whether service with the Australian Merchant Marine was the same as service with the Merchant Navy. This matter is presently being considered by an inquiry being conducted by the Tribunal.

The Tribunal's Findings

11

Commonwealth of Australia Gazette, No 91, 30 November 1949.

40. To be eligible for the 1939-45 Star Mr Whelan needed to have served for six months afloat during the period 3 September 1939 to 2 September 1945 in the designated area (the sea around Australia is included) with at least one voyage through a specified area of operations (for example, New Guinea).

41. The Tribunal noted that there was insufficient documentary evidence to prove conclusively that Mr Whelan served afloat for six months. But considering the available evidence and the broader context of the war, the Tribunal found that on the balance of probabilities, Mr Whelan served for at least 50 days 'afloat' during the period 8 June 1944 and 15 August 1945 and hence in total (including the previously accepted period of 132 days) he would have served for at least six months afloat during the required period for him to be eligible for the 1939-45 Star.

42 To be eligible for the Pacific Star Mr Whelan needed to have been eligible for the 1939-45 Star and have served in the Pacific Ocean, South China Sea or part of the Indian Ocean. As noted in the preceding paragraph, the Tribunal found that Mr Whelan was eligible for the 1939-45 Star. Further, the Tribunal found that there was clear evidence that Mr Whelan had served in the Pacific Ocean area and hence that he was also entitled to the Pacific Star.

43. The question of Mr Whelan's eligibility for the ASM 1939-45 should be held over until the Tribunal concluded its 'Inquiry into Unresolved Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ships Section'.

DECISIONS

44. The Tribunal has decided that:

a. the decision of the Directorate of Honours and Awards of the Department of Defence that Mr Charles Leonard Whelan not be awarded the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star be substituted by the new decision that Mr Whelan be awarded the 1939-45 Star and the Pacific Star; and

b the review of Mr Whelan's eligibility for the Australia Service Medal 1939-45 should be held over until the Tribunal has concluded its 'Inquiry Into Unresolved Recognition for Service with the United States Army Small Ships Section'.